Rethinking Self-Direction Work Study Practices
Presented by the BEST Research Practice Partnership

http://www.best-future.org

Dr. Karin Hess, President
Educational Research in Action, LLC

Kathy White, Director of Innovative Projects, NHLI
Webinar Host

Wendy Surr, Principal
Wendy Surr Consulting

Social Studies Content Leads:

- Cathy Baylus, Laconia School District
- Tony Doucet, Souhegan High School
- Elizabeth Gouzoules, Rochester School District
- Donna Harvey-Moseley, Sanborn School District
- Jessica Tremblay, Souhegan High School
- Nicole Woulfe, Sanborn School District
Rethinking Self-Direction Work Study Practices
Presented by the BEST Research Practice Partnership
http://www.best-future.org

With funding from the:
Rethinking Self-Direction Work Study Practices:
What is self-direction? How do students develop these skills? How can they be taught and consistently measured?

Dr. Karin Hess, Educational Research in Action

https://www.karin-hess.com/
July 2020
Webinar Overview


Alignment Study Methods
- Research in Self-Direction Skills
- Research in Rubric Design
- Alignment Findings

Revised (2020) SD Rubrics
- Kid-friendly wording, research-based, getting feedback (piloting, using think alouds with students)
- Supporting implementation school wide
Why revisit the New Hampshire Work Study Practices Rubrics for Self-Direction?

Competencies are Agreed-Upon Expectations for Learning (Hess, Colby, & Joseph, 2020)

- Observable and measurable
- Manageable, in terms of numbers and grain size
- Articulate increasingly more rigorous and sophisticated learning K-12
- Are valid (measure what they say they are measuring)
- Provide instructional guidance

How can teachers *consistently* measure self-direction skills?
How can teachers consistently measure self-direction skills?

- Task Design Requirement
- Conferencing: Teacher-Student or Peer-Peer
- Self-Reflection Products (essay, infographic, etc.)
- “Systematic” Observation
What is Observable & Measurable?

### SELF-DIRECTION WORK STUDY PRACTICES COMMON RUBRIC GRDES 6-8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SELF-DIRECTION</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SELF-AWARENESS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflecting on past experiences to evaluate one's own strengths, limitations, motivation, interests, and aspirations within different learning contexts.</td>
<td>• Evaluate progress based on short-term goals</td>
<td>• Draw on relevant prior experiences to identify successful learning strategies.</td>
<td>• Reflect on past experiences to identify strengths and potential for growth.</td>
<td>• Describe and connect prior learning experiences and interests with current context.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INITIATIVE AND OWNERSHIP</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking responsibility for learning, finding purposeful driving questions, shaping opportunities to fit personal interests and learning style, and seeking input from others.</td>
<td>• Demonstrate understanding of emotional triggers and regulates behavior</td>
<td>• Act positively with an understanding of my impact on the class, school and/or community</td>
<td>• Weigh the impact of behavior and usually express emotions appropriately</td>
<td>• Engage willingly in new experiences and explore personal interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOAL SETTING AND PLANNING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing long-term goals, establishing meaningful learning targets, identifying effective strategies, and planning out steps.</td>
<td>• Reflect on multiple options for learning goals and actions before establishing the learning plan</td>
<td>• Set learning goals and sequence actions towards accomplishing the goal</td>
<td>• Follow a process to set learning goals and begins sequence actions to accomplish goals</td>
<td>• Follow a teacher directed process for setting learning goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENGAGING AND MANAGING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seeking out relevant resources and information to support learning goals and refining strategies. Maintaining effective pace, reaching short-term benchmarks and long-term goals.</td>
<td>• Intrinsically motivated to learn new topics beyond personal interests</td>
<td>• Follow a process identified by teacher or peer to make forward progress towards targets and goals</td>
<td>• Notice strategies used by others to direct own behavior</td>
<td>• Engage in learning about topics of interest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MONITORING AND ADAPTING</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluating progress, adapting strategies, seizing failure in order to grow from mistakes, and attributing success to effort and motivation.</td>
<td>• Respond to changing conditions by evaluating options and adjusting actions appropriately</td>
<td>• Monitor learning and identify areas that need correction</td>
<td>• Follow a process to periodically check learning performance</td>
<td>• Adjust pace, work quality, and/or approach when prompted or as needed to maintain forward progress.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TASK SPECIFIC

---

**NH Work Study Practices Rubrics for Self-Direction (2019)**
Alignment Study Methods – Applying the SD Research
[NH’s Performance Levels: Emerging—Developing—Applying—Extending]

Is there alignment *with the intent* of the Developmental Framework’s performance levels:

- **Beginner**: new to the task and context, follows directions or modeled behaviors, responds to guidance, learns to use skills in a controlled context
- **Advanced Beginner**: familiar with a specific task and context, follows rules, purposefully explores through trial and error, looks to others for support, uses known steps to complete a task, discovers patterns
- **Strategic Learner**: completes different forms of tasks in related contexts, analyzes situations to plan approach, refines approach by testing ideas, selectively draws on expertise of others, identifies familiar aspects of tasks to determine relevant strategies
- **Emerging Expert**: experiences wide variations of tasks in different contexts, analyzes unfamiliar situations/contexts, seeks connections to others to broaden skills, looks for connections in other areas and tailors application of skills, notices what is missing
Alignment Study Methods – Applying Rubric Design Research
Hess PLC Tool # 11: Rubric Quality Review

1. Adjacent performance levels are qualitatively different; reflect how learning naturally progresses with instruction
2. Uses descriptive language; avoids subjective and judgmental language
3. Emphasizes quality (e.g., valid sources) over quantity (e.g., 3 sources)
4. All performance levels stated in the positive – what IS happening
5. Describes excellent rather than perfect performance
6. Descriptors and criteria match increasing levels of rigor for task expectations
7. Wording is “kid friendly”
Analyzing & Revising NH’s Self-Direction Rubrics

• Descriptors **were deleted** if judged to be too subjective, used negative language, or were too vague to reliably gather evidence and assess consistently across classrooms.

• If rubric descriptors consistent with the focus in the Developmental Framework were not included, **more were added**.

• Descriptions at the lowest performance levels and stated in the negative - describing what students were NOT doing **were revised**.

• Multiple bullets for each criterion were **consolidated to be more manageable and create a clear focus for documenting evidence**.

• Lower grade spans (K-2 and 3-5) either lacked any descriptors or overlapped with other grade levels, making it hard for elementary student to know how to reach the proficient level. **Overlap was minimized; new descriptors added**.
# Recommendations - NH Self-Direction Rubric for Grades 6-8:

## I can ...

### Self-Direction (focus)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extending</th>
<th>Applying</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SELF-AWARENESS</strong>&lt;br&gt;Reflecting on past experiences to evaluate one’s own strengths, limitations, motivation, interests, and aspirations within different learning contexts.</td>
<td>Cite examples from my work to evaluate my progress in overcoming barriers and expanding my strengths (4f)</td>
<td>Draw on relevant prior experiences to locate and explain examples of successfully using new learning strategies. (3a)</td>
<td>Analyze how familiar strategies have been used or expanded in new situations. (3b)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Initiative and Ownership | Redefine a task challenge to propel my own learning in meaningful directions (4c) | Collaborate with others to pursue interests while shaping new learning opportunities. (3a/3c/3f) | Recognize my own role in learning by proactively asking relevant questions and seeking relevant support when needed to complete a task (2b/2e) | Choose a learning opportunity from options provided by others (1c) |

| Goal Setting & Planning | Diagnose project-specific expectations, set personally meaningful learning targets that exceed requirements and create a plan to complete them. (4c/3d) | Analyze project-specific expectations and resources needed to formulate a plan with key steps to complete the project. (3d) | Use familiar learning strategies and processes to set a learning goal, develop a plan to meet the goal, and seek feedback from others to refine the plan (3c/3e) | Use strategies suggested by others to develop steps to accomplish a project when the specific learning goal has been provided. (1c/2b) |

| Engaging & Managing | Analyze how or why I have adapted strategies or refined my pace or approach based on feedback or when faced with roadblocks. (4b/3d) | Maintain appropriate focus and pace using set benchmarks for completing a multi-step task or project. (2d/3d) | Seek help or try models of others when using new resources or strategies to accomplish a multi-step task. (1b/2b) | Follow a process provided to select resources based on task requirements or suggested criteria. (2a) |

| Monitoring & Adapting | Analyze my learning in terms of meeting project goals, transforming mistakes into new learning, and enhancing personal growth. (4a/4f) | Evaluate my progress, citing examples of successful strategies used and analyzing the effectiveness of changes made to what I’ve learned. (4b/4c) | Use established benchmarks to evaluate whether I should adopt a strategy, refine my methods, or consider a different approach. (2a/3b) | Make changes to improve my plan or the quality of my work when gaps in my understanding or process are identified by others. (1b) |
Overall Alignment Study Findings (across all grade spans)
Applying the SD Research to Inform Suggested Revisions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Revised SD Rubrics Alignment</th>
<th>Earlier SD Rubrics Alignment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring &amp; Adapting</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging &amp; Managing</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal Setting &amp; Planning</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initiative &amp; Ownership</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Awareness</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Getting Feedback & Fine Turning Revised Rubrics

• Comparing earlier SD rubrics with revised SD rubrics
  • Piloting with students
  • Using to inform instruction or task design

• Using think alouds with students

• Input from teacher leads and field experts at NHLI
Sample Focus Group “Think Aloud” Questions

• **Read the descriptions at the Applying Level.** Is it clear what you would need to do to demonstrate self-direction when working on a performance task or project?

• **Are any of the descriptions at the Applying Level confusing?** Why?

• **Think about a performance task you’ve done recently for this class.** Could you use this rubric to help you identify evidence of your own self-direction skills?

• **Could you use this rubric to help you write a personal reflection or conference with your teacher?**
A New Mindset
Developing Self-Direction Skills

What if we described the increasing complexity of self-direction skills, (Beginner to Emerging Expert) as a learning progression?

What if we thought about these skills as interrelated and developmental...increasing in sophistication over time?
5 Dimensions of Self-Directed Learning


- **SELF-AWARENESS** - Reflecting on myself as a learner

- **INITIATIVE AND OWNERSHIP** - Taking responsibility for my learning

- **GOAL SETTING & PLANNING** - Developing a plan to accomplish my learning goals

- **ENGAGING & MANAGING** - Seeking resources to support my learning and managing my time

- **MONITORING & ADAPTING** - Evaluating my progress, learning from challenges and missteps
Applying the Concept & Visual of Scarborough’s “Rope Model” of Reading
Self-Awareness
Cite examples from my work to evaluate my progress, overcome barriers, expand strengths.
Use relevant prior work/experiences to locate and explain examples of successful use of new strategies.
Analyze how familiar strategies have been used or expanded ...
Identify my strengths and areas needed for growth, using feedback from others.

Initiative & Ownership
Propel my own learning in meaningful directions by redefining a task challenge.
Shape new learning by engaging with others to generate learning goals ...
Recognize my own role in learning by proactively asking relevant questions, seeking support ...
Choose a learning opportunity from options provided by others.

Goal Setting & Planning
Diagnose project expectations, set personally meaningful learning goals ...
Analyze project expectations and resources needed to formulate a plan ...
Use familiar learning strategies and processes to set a learning goal, develop a plan to meet goals, ...
Use strategies suggested by others to develop steps to accomplish a project ...

Engaging & Managing
Analyze how or why I adapted strategies or refined my pace or approach ...
Maintain focus and pace using agreed-upon benchmarks ...
Seek help or try models of others when using new resources or strategies to accomplish ...
Follow a process provided to select resources based on task requirements ...

Monitoring & Adapting
Analyze my learning in terms of meeting project goals, transforming mistakes into new learning, ...
Evaluate my progress, citing examples of successful strategies used and analyzing ...
Use established benchmarks to evaluate whether I should adapt a strategy, refine methods, or ...
Make changes to improve my plan or the quality of my work when gaps are ...
Although counterintuitive, collaboration is intricately related to self-directed learning. Learners develop self-directed learning skills as they engage with others.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-DIRECTION (focus)</th>
<th>Extending</th>
<th>Applying</th>
<th>Developing</th>
<th>Emerging</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SELF-AWARENESS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflecting on past experiences to evaluate one's own strengths, limitations, motivation, interests, and aspirations within different learning contexts</td>
<td>Cite examples from my work to evaluate my progress in overcoming barriers and expanding my strengths.</td>
<td>Use relevant prior work or experiences to locate and explain examples of when I successfully used new learning strategies.</td>
<td>Analyze how familiar strategies have been used or expanded upon in a new project.</td>
<td>Identify my strengths and areas needed for growth, using feedback from others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INITIATIVE AND OWNERSHIP</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taking responsibility for learning, finding purposeful driving questions, shaping opportunities to fit personal interests and learning style, and seeking input from others</td>
<td>Propel my own learning in more meaningful directions by redefining a task challenge.</td>
<td>Shape new learning opportunities by engaging with others to generate learning goals that match personal interests or strengths.</td>
<td>Recognize my own role in learning by proactively asking relevant questions and seeking specific support when needed to complete a task.</td>
<td>Choose a learning opportunity from options provided by others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>GOAL SETTING &amp; PLANNING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing long-term goals, establishing meaningful learning targets, identifying effective strategies, and planning out steps</td>
<td>Diagnose project-specific expectations, set personally meaningful learning goals that may exceed requirements and create a plan to complete them.</td>
<td>Analyze project-specific expectations and resources needed to formulate a plan with key steps and strategies to complete the project.</td>
<td>Use familiar learning strategies and processes to set a learning goal, develop a plan to meet the goal, and seek feedback from others to refine the plan.</td>
<td>Use strategies suggested by others to develop steps to accomplish a project when the specific learning goal has been provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENGAGING &amp; MANAGING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seeking out relevant resources and information to support learning goals and refining strategies. Maintaining effective pace, reaching short-term benchmarks and long-term goals</td>
<td>Analyze how or why I adapted strategies or refined my pace or approach based on feedback or when I faced roadblocks.</td>
<td>Maintain appropriate focus and pace using agreed-upon benchmarks for completing a multi-step task or project.</td>
<td>Seek help or try models of others when using new resources or strategies to accomplish a multi-step task or project.</td>
<td>Follow a process provided to select resources based on task requirements or suggested criteria.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MONITORING &amp; ADAPTING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluating progress, adapting strategies, seizing failure in order to grow from mistakes, and attributing success to effort and motivation.</td>
<td>Analyze my learning in terms of meeting project goals, transforming mistakes into new learning, and enhancing work quality and personal growth.</td>
<td>Evaluate my progress, citing examples of successful strategies used and analyzing the effectiveness of changes made to complete a high-quality multi-step task or project.</td>
<td>Use established criteria or benchmarks to evaluate whether I should adapt a strategy, refine my methods, or consider a different approach to improve quality.</td>
<td>Make changes to improve my plan or the quality of my work when gaps in my understanding or process are identified by others.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

© New Hampshire Learning Initiative. (June 25, 2020 draft). Use only with full citation. Feedback on rubric is welcome and can be sent to ehumehoward@nhlearninginitiative.org.
Clarifying Some Rubric Wording

1. “guided” - strategically scaffolding using teacher-designed models, processes, or steps

2. “prompted” or “with support” - a specific correction or redirection is given “in the moment” of learning

3. “proactive” or “initiate” or “take responsibility” or “propel my learning” - the student (not the teacher) directs learning actions (e.g., seek input from peers, redesign a task)
Ideas for Supporting School Wide Implementation

• Introducing and using the self-direction rubric with students
• Designing lessons and assessment tasks that integrate use of self-direction skills
• Tools that support students in managing projects, identifying evidence, and reflecting on learning
• Others?
Next Steps

• Pilot rubric with new evidence collection tools in classrooms
• Seek input from a wider range of educators in the field
• Bring alignment process to remaining three Work-Study Practices
Thank You

• Thank you for joining us for the Self-Direction Rubric Webinar the first in the series of Self-Direction Toolkit webinars
• If you would like additional information please contact: Kathy White at kwhite@nhlearninginitiative.org
• Join us for the Self-Direction Toolkit Webinar Series
  • Self-Direction Tools Webinar
  • Instructional Strategies Webinar
  • Implementing the Toolkit Webinar
Resources Referenced


  • Tool #17: Conducting Cognitive Labs/Think Alouds


• Video clip: [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OdRoFFfQ4fl](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OdRoFFfQ4fl) – What is a Think Aloud (also called “cognitive lab”)? Dr. Hess explains to students what a “Think Aloud” is (first 2 min of video).