

## Recommended Revisions to New Hampshire’s Work Study Practices Collaboration Rubrics Based on an Alignment Review Using the *Essential Skills and Dispositions Developmental Framework*<sup>1</sup> for Collaboration

Wording revisions to the NH Work Study Practices rubrics for collaboration have been recommended based on a May 2020 alignment study. To create the updated rubrics, descriptions in New Hampshire’s current grade span rubrics were compared with descriptions in the Developmental Framework for collaboration. The revised collaboration rubrics are still structured to be “cumulative” from one level to the next. Rationales for changes are described below.

- Descriptors that were judged to be too subjective, used negative language (e.g., behavioral), or were inconsistent with the Developmental Framework focus were eliminated.
- Where there were multiple bullets, they were combined into a more concise statement to facilitate consistent evidence collection and clearer scoring.
- The use of identical indicators across all performance levels at the same grade span with qualifiers (from “not yet able” to “with support” to “independently”) was eliminated. This made it possible to show a cumulative progression of less complex to more complex skills for each sub-domain.
- The qualifier “not yet able” was eliminated under the Emerging performance level and replaced with descriptions of what student could actually do when getting started. These indicators often include the phrase “**with prompting**” – meaning that during instruction, a teacher might have to model a response, prompt with a reminder, or redirect a student to take turns, share ideas, ask for feedback, etc.
- The qualifier “**with guidance**” is not to be interpreted as the same as simply redirecting or reminding a student. Guidance implies that the teacher has provided a protocol or process to be followed, such as steps a group might use to reach consensus. These same protocols could also be used when groups self-evaluate progress (e.g., did we encourage each member to contribute ideas? Did we ask follow-up questions?).
- *To the degree possible*, checks were made for both vertical coherence across grade spans (for each of the five Framework dimensions) and consistency within each performance level (across all five dimensions) for each grade span (e.g., what does a student whose performance falls under “Extending” or “Applying” or “Developing” or “Emerging” know and do?).
- Sometimes, identical or very similar indicators made sense to use at adjacent grade spans. This brings NH’s performance levels into closer alignment *with the intent* of the Framework’s corresponding performance levels (p. 3) which does not match performance levels with a grade level or age:
  - **Beginner:** **shows respect** for different perspectives **with some support and modeling**, cares about how others feel, and **defers to the group** for decision making and task management
  - **Advanced Beginner:** remains open to competing ideas from others, avoids conflict, **cooperates to keep the group moving forward**, and takes turns to be fair
  - **Strategic Learner:** values all group members’ perspectives, **initiates compromise to move work forward, and builds consensus** to define roles and tasks that match group members’ strengths

---

<sup>1</sup> *Essential Skills and Dispositions Developmental Framework*. (2015). National Center for Innovation in Education. <https://www.inflexion.org/essential-skills-and-dispositions-development-frameworks/>

- Emerging Expert: synthesizes a group's best thinking, voices and addresses power imbalances, and anticipates conflicts in order to strengthen group cohesion

### Suggested Revisions to NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades K-2

Collaboration(focus)	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
<b>SELF-AWARENESS</b> Thinking through tasks, applying prior experience, understanding how one's own strengths fit into the group dynamic and taking personal responsibility.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to suggest ways to improve the quality of our final product (e.g., using a peer conferencing rubric). 3a, 3d</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to figure out what tasks we each can do to accomplish our shared goal. 3a, 3c</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Choose what I'll do to help my group meet a goal and work to complete my part (with guidance). 2c</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Show that I understand group processes by paying attention and suggesting ways I can help with group tasks (with prompting). 1a, 1b, 1c</li> </ul>
<b>COMMUNICATING</b> Speaking purposefully, listening actively, contributing to group dialogue, and encouraging participation of others.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Encourage everyone to participate by asking follow-up questions that help the group to better understand ideas or suggestions. 2b, 4b</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Give suggestions to others and ask for feedback that helps me clarify my ideas. 1d, 3e</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Answer questions that help me say more about my ideas and ask questions to get more information about the ideas of others (with guidance). 1a, 2a</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Take turns speaking, share my ideas, and listen to ideas from each group member (with prompting). 1a, 1b</li> </ul>
<b>NEGOCIATING/ DECISION-MAKING</b> Understanding and valuing multiple perspectives, managing conflict and one's own emotional response and advocating for group equity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Suggest ways that the group might work out a conflict or problem. 3c</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Contribute to group planning and suggest ways to be fair with assigning tasks. 2f</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to compare how each of our ideas might be different or the same (with guidance). 1a</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Recognize how others feel and try to work out differences when we disagree. (with guidance) 1d</li> </ul>
<b>CONTRIBUTING &amp; SUPPORTING</b> Owning task assignments and work quality, sharing ideas, and providing feedback on the work and ideas of others.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to assess how we did in meeting group goals and suggest ways to improve the quality of our work next time (with guidance). 4d</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Meet group expectations for contributing and completing my part of the group's work. 1a, 1c, 2b</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ask for feedback on my ideas and give feedback to others when asked (with guidance). 2e</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Share my ideas and respond to the ideas of others with a question or personal opinion (with prompting). 1d, 1e</li> </ul>
<b>MONITORING &amp; ADAPTING</b> Reflecting on progress, overcoming obstacles, adjusting emotional reactions, supporting others through challenges and modifying approaches to benefit the group.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reflect with my group on progress we made and what we learned. 3a</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Build on ideas and suggestions of others to improve our group's strategies or plan. 2f, 3d</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Suggest ideas when my group has a problem and needs to make changes to our plan (with guidance). 2c, 2e</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reflect on my progress and follow guidance from others when I need help (with prompting). 1a, 1b</li> </ul>

**Suggested Revisions to NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades 3-5**

Self-Direction (focus)	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
<p><b>SELF-AWARENESS</b> Thinking through tasks, <b>applying prior experience</b>, understanding <b>how one's own strengths fit into the group dynamic</b> and taking personal responsibility.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group</b> to set group goals and roles to <b>improve the quality of our final product.</b> <b>3a, 3d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to analyze possible strategies and choose the best approach</b> to accomplish our shared goal. <b>3a, 3d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Choose my role</b> and complete my tasks to help my group meet a goal (with guidance). <b>2b, 2c</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Suggest ways I will <b>contribute my strengths</b> to help with group tasks (with prompting). <b>1b</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>COMMUNICATING</b> Speaking purposefully, <b>listening actively</b>, <b>contributing</b> to group dialogue, and <b>encouraging participation of others.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Encourage everyone to participate by asking follow-up questions, giving relevant feedback, or showing appreciation for each person's contributions.</b> <b>3c, 4b, 4d, 4f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Provide supporting evidence for my ideas and ask others to elaborate on their perspectives</b> so I can better understand them. <b>3a, 3b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Clarify or elaborate on my ideas when asked and ask others for more information about their ideas.</b> <b>1a, 2a</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Take turns when sharing my ideas, <b>giving suggestions, or listening to ideas shared by others</b> (with prompting). <b>1a, 1b, 1d</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>NEGOTIATING/ DECISION-MAKING</b> <b>Understanding and valuing multiple perspectives, managing conflict</b> and one's own emotional response and advocating for group equity.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Ask others to share different points of view when we are trying to find a way to resolve a conflict.</b> <b>3c, 4a</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to identify each person's ideas, strengths, or interests and agree on how to fairly assign tasks and roles.</b> <b>3a, 3e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Contribute my ideas to group planning and suggest ways to be fair when deciding on possible tasks</b> (with guidance). <b>2f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Compare my ideas to ideas of others and respond to questions that help me understand the differences</b> (with guidance). <b>1a, 2a</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>CONTRIBUTING &amp; SUPPORTING</b> <b>Owning</b> task assignments and <b>work quality, sharing ideas, and providing feedback</b> on the work and ideas of others.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to assess the results of our work and suggest ways we can improve the quality of our work next time.</b> <b>4d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Meet group expectations for completing my individual tasks and contributing to the quality of my group's work.</b> <b>2a, 3c</b></li> </ul>	<p><b>Ask for feedback on my ideas and give feedback to others based on group expectations and planning.</b> <b>2d, 2e</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Share my ideas and explain how they could help meet our group's expectations.</b> <b>1b, 1d</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>MONITORING &amp; ADAPTING</b> <b>Reflecting on progress, overcoming obstacles,</b> adjusting emotional reactions, supporting</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Reflect with my group on progress we made and what we've learned from problems or challenges we</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Affirm and build on ideas of others and help my group change our plan to improve our strategies or our</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to identify challenges and look for possible solutions</b> (with guidance). <b>2b, 2e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Reflect on my progress and reach out to others for help when needed</b></li> </ul>

others through challenges and <b>modifying approaches to benefit the group.</b>	<b>had to overcome together. 3a, 4d</b>	<b>processes. 2f, 3d</b>		(with prompting and guidance). <b>1a, 2c</b>
---	---	--------------------------	--	--

**Suggested Revisions to NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades 6-8**

<b>Collaboration (focus)</b>	<b>Extending I can also ...</b>	<b>Applying I can also ...</b>	<b>Developing I can also ...</b>	<b>Emerging I can ...</b>
<b>SELF-AWARENESS</b> Thinking through tasks, <b>applying prior experience</b> , understanding <b>how one's own strengths fit into the group dynamic</b> and taking personal responsibility.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Describe how I contributed my strengths and overcame challenges to improve the quality of my group's final product. 3c, 4c</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to set group goals, <b>analyze possible approaches to accomplish tasks, and assign individual roles that maximize group potential. 3a, 4a</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Show a commitment to group goals <b>and adjust my responsibilities to ensure that my contributions meet group expectations</b> for high quality work (with guidance). <b>2d, 3d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Draw on past experiences when working with my group to <b>establish norms for group processes</b> and guide my contributions to group tasks (with guidance). <b>1a, 2b</b></li> </ul>
<b>COMMUNICATING</b> Speaking purposefully, <b>listening actively, contributing</b> to group dialogue, and <b>encouraging participation of others.</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Contribute well-supported ideas and validate each team member's contributions with positive reinforcement and constructive feedback. 4a, 4d, 4f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to <b>pose questions, seek feedback, and analyze different perspectives in order to modify a position. 3b, 3e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Justify my point of view with supporting evidence and pose questions or give feedback to others to clarify their points of view</b> (with guidance). <b>2d, 3a, 3b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Share <b>and elaborate on</b> my perspectives and encourage others to <b>share their perspectives</b> during group dialogue (with prompting). <b>1a, 3c</b></li> </ul>
<b>NEGOCIATING/ DECISION-MAKING</b> <b>Understanding and valuing multiple perspectives, managing conflict</b> and one's own emotional response and advocating for group equity.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Work with my group to evaluate possible trade-offs and merits of each idea and find a way to resolve conflicts that honor each member's contributions. 3d, 4b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Work with my group to <b>build consensus when determining tasks and roles needed to achieve group goals, based on each person's strengths or interests. 3e, 4f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Use my understanding of differing perspectives and approaches to develop shared group goals, roles, and tasks. 2a, 3f, 4g</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Follow a process provided by the teacher to advocate for my ideas, consider ideas of others, and work towards group consensus. 1b, 2d, 2e</b></li> </ul>
<b>CONTRIBUTING &amp; SUPPORTING</b> <b>Owning</b> task assignments and <b>work quality, sharing ideas, and providing feedback</b> on the work and ideas of others.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Analyze alternative approaches that could increase my personal learning or advance the overall quality of my group's performance. 3a, 4c, 4d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Support my group by working to complete individual and group tasks and evaluating the effectiveness of our approach or quality of our final product. 2a, 3c</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Affirm the efforts and ideas of others and suggest ways to use them to advance group expectations and planning. 2f, 3b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Explain how my contributions could help to meet expectations for completing my group's work. 2d</b></li> </ul>

<p><b>MONITORING &amp; ADAPTING</b>  <b>Reflecting on progress, overcoming obstacles,</b> adjusting emotional reactions, supporting others through challenges and <b>modifying approaches to benefit the group.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to reflect on group progress and adapt norms, roles, or strategies to optimize the collective group effort. 4f, 4g</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to</b> analyze challenges, identify the need for different strategies, and adjust our approach to meet individual or group needs. <b>3a, 3b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Contribute ideas and build upon suggestions from others to make possible individual or group course corrections (with guidance). 2e, 2f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Monitor my progress in completing tasks and work through challenges with help from others. 2a, 2c</b></li> </ul>
---	--	---	--	--

**Suggested Revisions to NH Collaboration Rubric for Grades 9-12**

Collaboration (focus)	Extending I can also ...	Applying I can also ...	Developing I can also ...	Emerging I can ...
<p><b>SELF-AWARENESS</b>            Thinking through tasks, <b>applying prior experience,</b> understanding <b>how one's own strengths fit into the group dynamic</b> and taking personal responsibility.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Analyze how my roles and responsibilities within the group dynamics</b> demonstrated individual responsibility <b>and enhanced group equity. 4c, 4d, 4e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Work with my group to adapt <b>approaches and overcome potential challenges</b> to accomplish a shared goal <b>and maximize group potential. 3a, 4a</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to analyze our approach</b> and plan out equitable tasks so that <b>each member's contributions meet group expectations</b> for high quality work (with guidance). <b>2c, 3a, 3d, 4e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Work with my group to set group goals and roles, establish norms for group processes, and identify or adapt my contributions to meet group needs (with guidance). <b>1c, 2d, 4a</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>COMMUNICATING</b>            Speaking purposefully, <b>listening actively, contributing</b> to group dialogue, and <b>encouraging participation of others.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Contribute well-supported ideas and validate each team member's contributions with positive reinforcement and constructive feedback. 4a, 4d, 4f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Pose direct follow-up questions, seek relevant feedback, and evaluate different perspectives in order to</b> modify, or strengthen a position. <b>3b, 3e, 4b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Justify my point of view with supporting evidence and pose questions or give relevant feedback to others to help them clarify their points of view. 2d, 3a, 3b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Share <b>and elaborate on</b> my perspectives and encourage others <b>to clarify their perspectives</b> during group dialogue. <b>1a, 2a</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>NEGOTIATING/ DECISION-MAKING</b>  <b>Understanding and valuing multiple perspectives, managing conflict</b> and one's own emotional response and advocating for group equity.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to evaluate the effects of decisions made to resolve conflicts in terms of honoring each member's contributions and strengthening group cohesiveness. 3d, 4b, 4d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Resolve potential group conflicts by refining my position or seeking a compromise that builds on the group's best ideas. 2c, 3c, 4c</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Work with my group to <b>build consensus</b> when determining tasks and roles needed to achieve group goals, based on each person's strengths or interests. <b>3e, 4f</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Follow an established process provided to advocate for my ideas, consider ideas of others, and work towards group consensus. 1b, 2d, 2e</b></li> </ul>
<p><b>CONTRIBUTING &amp; SUPPORTING</b>  <b>Owning</b> task assignments and <b>work quality, sharing ideas, and providing feedback</b> on the work and ideas of others.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Analyze alternative approaches that could increase my personal learning or advance the overall quality of my group's performance. 3a, 4c, 4d</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Complete my individual tasks, and work with my group to evaluate the effort and quality of our contributions in meeting group goals. 2a, 4b</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Affirm the efforts, ideas, and contributions of team members and give constructive feedback based on group expectations and planning. 3e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Identify my individual contributions and justify how they could help to meet specific group needs or goals. 2d, 3d</b></li> </ul>

<p><b>MONITORING &amp; ADAPTING</b>  <b>Reflecting on progress, overcoming obstacles,</b>          adjusting emotional reactions, supporting others through challenges and <b>modifying approaches to benefit the group.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to reflect on progress and adapt group norms, roles, or strategies to optimize the collective group effort and enhance a positive group dynamic. 4f, 4g</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to evaluate group progress and needs, seek solutions, and reassign responsibilities to troubleshoot problems. 3f, 3g</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Work with my group to identify potential challenges or the need to adjust our approach in order to meet individual or group needs. 3b, 3e</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Identify models, approaches, or support that will help me to overcome barriers in completing my tasks and work through challenges. 2a, 2b, 2c</b></li> </ul>
--	---	--	--	--

DRAFT